



# Informal Governance and Corruption – Transcending the Principal Agent and Collective Action Paradigms

## Kyrgyzstan

### Annex to Macro Level Report

Ismailbekova, A. | July 2018

This research has been funded by the UK government's Department for International Development (DFID) and the British Academy through the British Academy/DFID Anti-Corruption Evidence Programme. However, the views expressed do not necessarily reflect those of the British Academy or DFID.



# Annex 1: Detailed data on informal networks in Kyrgyzstan

Table 1: Administrative framework - territorial structure of Kyrgyzstan<sup>1</sup>

Region	Province Level Administration [Governor]	Rayon Level Administration [akim]	Lineage affiliations
North	Naryn	Ak-Talaa, At-Bashy, Jungal, Kochkor, Naryn	Mongoldor, Tynymseit, Cherek-Sayak, Sary Bagysh
	Chüi	Alamudun, Jaiyl, Yssyk-Ata , Kemin  Moscow ,Panfilov, Sokuluk , Chüi	Suu Murun, Kultu, Bolokbai, and Tata.  Jeti Kul and Kungtu.  Talkan. Solto
	Issik-Kul  Talas	Karak-Kol, Jeti-Oguz	Bugu, Sayak, Kalmak  Saruu.Nuitai, Kuschu, Kitai
South	Osh	Kadamjai, Leilek, Batken	Jediger, Ichkilik
	Jalal-Abad		Adagine, Muduz
	Batken		Teiyt  Mungush

<sup>1</sup> The territorial administrative framework of the Northern and Southern Province are organized along kinship lines. The republic of Kyrgyzstan is divided into seven administrative provinces (Naryn, Issik Kol, Talas, Chüi, Osh, Jalal Abad, Batken), in addition to the capital Bishkek. Each province (or oblast) consists of several districts (rayon) and cities that, in turn, are divided into village municipalities (ayyl ökmötü). Each district (rayon) is associated with a particular lineage. A system of local administration is closely aligned with this division of territory. The table 1 illustrates the territorial-administrative units of several provinces of Kyrgyzstan.

## 1.1 Peculiarities of Kinsmen in Kyrgyzstan and their Influence on the Elections

Table 2: The List of Southern Informal Network of Bakiev during his Presidency

	Name	Position	Birth place
1.	Nur uulu Dosbol	Secretary of State	Batken city, Batken region
2.	Zhanysh Bakiev	Head of Security Service	Suzak district. Jalal-Abad region
3	Ismail Isakov	Secretary of the Security Council	Alai district. Osh region
4	Kambaraly Kongantiev	Representative of the President of the Kyrgyz Republic in the Jogorku Kenesh	Jalal-Abad Oblast, city Mailuu-Suu.
5	Nurlan Shakeev	Press Secretary of the President of the Kyrgyz Republic	Jalal-Abad region, Aksy district.
6	Elmurza Satybaldiev	Prosecutor General of the Kyrgyz Republic	Osh region, Uzgen district.
7	Moldomusa Kongantiev	Minister of Internal Affairs of the KR	Jalal-Abad region, city Mailuu-Suu.
8	Bakyt Kalyev	Minister of Defense of the Kyrgyz Republic	Jalal-Abad region, Suzak District
9	Tadzhibkan Kalimbetova	Minister of Finance of the Kyrgyz Republic	Jalal-Abad region, Suzak district.

10	Marat Sultanov	Chairman of the Social Fund of the Kyrgyz Republic	Osh region, Alai district.
11	Kamchybek Tashiev	Minister of Emergency Situations of the Kyrgyz Republic	Jalal-Abad region, Suzak district
12	Nurlan Sulaimanov	Minister of Transport and Communications of the Kyrgyz Republic	Osh region, ChonAlay region.
13	Sultan Raev	Minister of Culture of the KR	Osh region, Kara-Suu district.
14	Ishenkul Baldzhurova	Minister of Education and Science of the KR	Jalal-Abad region.
15	Tursun Turdumambetov	Chairman of the State Committee of the Kyrgyz Republic on State Property Management -	Jalal-Abad region, Bazar-Korgon district.
16	Iskenderbek Gaypkulov	Head of the Accounts Chamber of the Kyrgyz Republic	Osh region, Aravan district.
17	Kurmanbek Temirbaev	Manager of the President's Affairs	Jalal-Abad region, Suzak district.
18	Uktomkhan Abdullayeva	Minister of Labor and Social Development of the Kyrgyz Republic	Osh region, Nookat District.

19	Orozmat Abdykalykov	Head of the National Statistical Committee of the Kyrgyz Republic	Osh region, Alay district.
20	Mamasadyk Bakirov	State Agency for Development of the Kyrgyz Republic  Local government	Osh region, Kara-Suu rayon
21	Marat Kaiypov	The Minister  Of Justice of the Kyrgyz Republic	Jalal-Abad region, Suzak district.
22	Adamzhan Zholdoshev	The State Agency for Registration of Rights to Immovable Property	Osh region,  The Uzgen District.
23	Akimzhan Muybillaev	Financial Police of the Kyrgyz Republic	Jalal-Abad region,  Ala Bukinsky district.
24	Turusbek Mamashov	State Agency for Tourism in	Osh region,  Kara-Kulja district
25	Bektur Asanov	State  Agency of the Kyrgyz Republic for Physical Education and Sport,  And the protection of children	Jalal- Abad region, Suzak district.
26	Aytibay Tagaev	Speaker of the Parliament	Osh region, Nookat district.
27	Aziz Tursunbayev	The head of the Ak Jol faction	of Jalal-Abad region,  Ala-Bukinsky district.
28	Baktybek Beshimov	The leader of the Social Democrats	Jalal-Abad Province, Ala- Bukinsky District.

29	Iskhak Masaliyev	The head of the Communist faction	of the Kadamjai region was earlier than the Osh and now the Batken region
30	Maxim Bakiev	Central Agency for Development, Investment and Innovation	Jalal-Abad region
31	Marat Bakiev	The ambassador of the Kyrgyz Republic in Germany	Jalal-Abad region
32	Adil Bakiev	The post of sales representatives in Kyrgyzstan	Jalal-Abad region
33	Ahmat Bakiev	The uncrowned 'king' or informal leader of the Jalal-Abad region	Jalal-Abad region
34	Kanybek Bakiev	A head of the rural council in the village of Barpy of Jalal-Abad region	Jalal-Abad region
35	Marat Bakiev	An advisor of the chairman of the state national security service	Jalal-Abad region

Source: AE. Esenbaev, Vestnik KRSU, 2015. Volume 15 No 2

## 1.2 Bakiev's close entourage

Among President Bakiev's entourage are the following:

- Janish Bakiyev, the president Bakiev's brother, the former head of State Security Service / was given a life term for crimes including murder with confiscation of property.

- Marat Bakiyev, the president Bakiev's brother, the former Advisor to the Chairman of National Security Service / sentenced to 27 years imprisonment with confiscation of property.

- Maksim Bakiev, the president Bakiev's son, the former head of Investment Agency / sentenced to 27 years imprisonment with confiscation of property.

- Murat Sutalinov, the president Bakiev's closest person, the former Chairman of the State National Security Service. He is guilty of complicity in the murder of 77 people, and the organization of the attempted murder of 306 participants of the April events.

- Daniyar Usenov, the president Bakiev's closest person, the former Prime Minister/ sentenced to life imprisonment with confiscation of property. Usenov was found guilty of conspiring with the former leaders of the country who have decided to fire on demonstrators

Murat Sutalinov was arrested and put in jail of National Security Service for 20 years. Murat Sutalinov became oncologically sick. Recently, he even removed one kidney. The defendant needed a special treatment, such as immunotherapy and rehabilitation, which was possible only in a cancer center.

Therefore, the last process was suspended until the full recovery of ex-minister due to his serious condition, because he could not appear at the court meetings.<sup>2</sup>

Daniar Dunganov, the former deputy chairmen of the State Security Service, received 25 years in prison, in connection and was taken into custody in the courtroom. Daniar used to serve under Akaev as well as under Bakiev. During the Revolution in 2005, he remained in the White House, even though his clothes were torn and himself beaten. He explained his behaviour by saying that he was carrying out his professional duty under the attack, state must be the protected. Dunganov was blamed for 'simply serving to Bakiev', even though he performed his professional task. In 2016 he remained under house arrest.<sup>3</sup>

Additionally, a few people were arrested due to their service to Bakiev. Nurlan Temirbaev, for example, was also arrested up to 20 years in prison. Ex-Chief of Staff of the President Kanibek Joroev was sentenced to 10 years with confiscation of property obtained. The former Attorney General Nurlan Tursunkulov and a state adviser Elmurza Satybaldyev were taken into custody in the courtroom. But another person who is the head of the Presidential Secretariat Oksana Malevanaya was claimed as wanted. Two ex-commanders of the Special Forces 'Alpha' Almaz Dzholdoshaliev and 'Arstan' Baiysh Esenbay uulu were sentenced to six years in prison. Both of them were arrested in the courtroom. They were found guilty by abuse of office. It exempts from punishment and a former defense minister Baktybek Kalyev.<sup>4</sup>

### 1.3 Criminal Cases and Investigation against Aida Salyanova

There are several criminal cases against the former general prosecutor, Aida Salyanova. First, an elder brother Salyanova made a young girl as his mistress, took her to the sauna, and after that he sadistically killed her. Salyanova was accused of hiding the fact and thus prevented the disclosure of a criminal case against her brother because at the time of the crime Salyanova used to work as the general prosecutor. Second, Salyanova extended Maxim Bakiyev's lawyer's (Alexei Yeliseyev) license in 2010 despite the several criminal cases against him and his status as wanted.<sup>5</sup> Eliseev was not in the country during that time because he fled Kyrgyzstan after the April 2010 events. According to some reports, Eliseev transferred assets of Maxim Bakiyev from Kyrgyzstan to offshore in Belize and this was possible due to the extension of lawyer's license. Finally, her husband Bakyt Abdykalykov was involved in corruption cases in coal supply, and there was a criminal case against him, but she started protecting her husband and putting husband's interests higher than the national interests.<sup>6</sup> Salyanova, a lawyer with a great experience, is now accused of an article 304 "Abuse of office or official position" of the Criminal Code. This article assumes the penalty - a fine of from 3 to 5 million soms or imprisonment from 8 to 12 years with confiscation of property.<sup>7</sup>

<sup>2</sup> Dyaduchenko, Olga (2012) Murat Sutalinov zaplatil pochkoi za domashnyi arest. Vechernyi Bishkek. Published 06.10.2012. [http://www.vb.kg/doc/201906\_myrat\_sutalinov\_zaplatil\_pochkoy\_za\_domashniy\_arest.html] Accessed 23.03.2017.

<sup>3</sup> Fergana Kyrgyzstan: Tyazhelobolnogo Daniyara Dunganova otpustili iz SIZO pod domashnyi arest. Published 21.01.2013 [http://www.fergananews.com/news/20097] Accessed 23.03.2017

<sup>4</sup> Prokuratura prosit vzyat pod strazhu Sutanlinova i Dunganova. Zanoza.kg Published 01.03.2016 [http://zanoza.kg/doc/334161\_prokuryatya\_prosit\_vziat\_pod\_strajy\_sytalinova\_i\_dynganova.html] Accessed 23.03.2017

<sup>5</sup> After receiving the license, Eliseev opened the law firm in the city of Riga, and thus kept protecting the property of Maxim Bakiyev. The case of Eliseev's license is related to the conflict on the "MegaCom" because by April 7, 2010 the sole owner and founder of "Alfa Telecom" was Eliseev. Therefore, without the issuance of a license Eliseev it would not be possible to save 51% of the shares "Megakom". [http://www.gezitter.org/politic/56288\_stalo\_izvestno\_o\_zavershenii\_rassledovaniya\_dela\_svyazannogo\_s\_advokatskoy\_litsenzziy\_alek\_seya\_eliseeva\_i\_napravlenii\_ego\_v\_generalnyu\_prokuraturu/] published on the 23th of December, 2016

<sup>6</sup> Za chto na Aity Salyanovu vzbudili ugovnoe delo i kakoi srok ei grozit? Zanoza.kg Published 27.12.2016 [http://zanoza.kg/doc/349934\_za\_chto\_na\_aidy\_salyanovy\_vozbydili\_ugolovnoe\_delo\_i\_kakoy\_srok\_ey\_grozit.html/] Accessed 28.12.2016

<sup>7</sup> Aida Salyanova po obyknoveniyu opravdyvaetsya, ofitsialno podtverdila begstvo starshogo brata, podozrevaemogo v gibeli devushki. Gezitter.org. Published 23.12.2016 [http://www.gezitter.org/politic/56290\_aida\_salyanova\_po\_obyknoveniyu\_opravdyvaetsya\_ofitsialno\_podtverdila\_begstvo\_starshogo\_brata\_podozrevaemogo\_v\_gibeli\_devushki/] Accessed 28.12.2016



However, Salyanova considers all the criminal proceedings against her as a political persecution, because she openly started expressing her position and opposing the referendum in public.<sup>8</sup> All the family members of Salyanova are not interested in state, according to Salyanova, but the main target is she, therefore, as a sign of punishment, the state is also using her family members and persecuting them for illegal activities.<sup>9</sup> According to Salyanova, 'when she was Minister of Justice, she had no legal grounds to refuse to renew the license Eliseev'.<sup>10</sup> According to her, the illegal is a criminal case on this fact. The license was extended to Eliseev in June 2010, but criminal proceedings against Eliseev started only in 2012.<sup>11</sup> If during that time of extension, he was not under criminal investigation, therefore she could not refuse of extending Eliseev his license. Initiation of criminal proceedings shows the face, as Salyanova says, the weakness of the current authorities. Later, this fact can be taught at the universities as an example of political affairs' field.<sup>12</sup>

The local political scientist and researcher of Central Asia, Sherdail Baktygulov, claims that the actions of the former Minister of Justice Salyanova in terms of the Criminal Process is incorrect. In this case, it would have been appropriate to apply only the Administrative Code or the Code of Ethics of the civil servant and not more than that. In addition, these actions have to be applied to people who prepared all the documents for the extension of the license of the lawyer Eliseev. This includes the deputy minister, a head of the department, and other experts and consultants. There are no sufficient grounds the bringing of the case to the court.<sup>13</sup>

The second opponent in the list is Omurbek Tekebaev, who is also accused of several criminal cases: first, during the times of the first president Askar Akaev, Tekebaev got a plot of land in the central park of Bishkek, as a reward for creating a quorum in the parliament. This quorum allowed to give enough voice to transfer a big piece of land Uzongu-Kuush in Kyrgyzstan to China. However, at the moment Tekebaev is renting his piece of land for the owners of the café Frunze and earning a good amount of money.<sup>14</sup> In other words, it seems like that the plot of land is the result of corrupt schemes between Tekebaev and Akaev.<sup>15</sup> Second, after removal of the second president Bakiev, Tekebaev seemed to loot the properties and assets of Bakiev, such as gas stations Petroleum, cell banks, and Megacom. Third, once the issue with Megacom became publically visible, he hired an international lawyer to prove the falsification of the documents from Beliz, by paying hundred thousands of dollars for such a service.<sup>16</sup>

The deputy of the Jogorku Kenesh, a leader of the opposition party 'Ata Meken' Omurbek Tekebaev was arrested in February, 2017 for two months (February-April, 2017). The decision was taken by the judge of the Pervomaysky district court of Bishkek. The criminal case against the politician was initiated by the Prosecutor General's Office on corruption and fraud. His supporters are holding protests outside the National Security Service of Kyrgyzstan building and on the Ala-Too square.<sup>17</sup> Tekebaev is also blamed for organising pogroms during the 'Rose' Revolution in 2010.

According to Tekebaev, 'Kyrgyzstan established a dictatorship, the power is in the hand of one man and his party'. Tekebaev approaches people by stating that the history of the country is in their hands. Local power has such a wrong way, because it started prosecuting opponents, by massively discrediting the opponents of power, and unfortunately, these are the signs of the completion of the life of different

<sup>8</sup> Za chto na Aidy Salyanovu vobzudili ugolovnoe delo i kakoi srok ei grozit? Zanoza.kg Published 27.12 .2016 [http://zanoza.kg/doc/349934\_za\_chno\_na\_aidy\_salianovy\_vozbydili\_ygolovnoe\_delo\_i\_kakoy\_srok\_ey\_grozit.html] Accessed 28.12.2016

<sup>9</sup> Ibid.

<sup>10</sup> Za chto na Aidy Salyanovu vobzudili ugolovnoe delo i kakoi srok ei grozit? Zanoza.kg Published 27.12 .2016 [http://zanoza.kg/doc/349934\_za\_chno\_na\_aidy\_salianovy\_vozbydili\_ygolovnoe\_delo\_i\_kakoy\_srok\_ey\_grozit.html] Accessed 28.12.2016

<sup>11</sup> V otnoshenii deputata Aidy Salyanovoi vobzuzhdeno ugolovnoe delo. Azattyk, 26.12. 2016 [http://rus.azattyk.org/a/28197695.html/] Accessed 28.12.2016.

<sup>12</sup> Abdinabi uulu, Tumonbai (2016) Ugolovnoe delo v otnoshenii Salynovoi vyzvalo u obshestvennosti raznye mnenia. Gezitter.org. Published 28.12.2018

<sup>13</sup> Za chto na Aidy Salyanovu vobzudili ugolovnoe delo i kakoi srok ei grozit? Zanoza.kg Published 27.12 .2016 [http://zanoza.kg/doc/349934\_za\_chno\_na\_aidy\_salianovy\_vozbydili\_ygolovnoe\_delo\_i\_kakoy\_srok\_ey\_grozit.html] Accessed 28.12.2016

<sup>14</sup> Iskakov, Marat (2016) Tekebaev poluchil ot Akaeva uchastok v Dubovom parke za Uzgengu-Kuush? Vechernyi Bishkek. Published 28.10. 2016 [http://www.vb.kg/doc/349534\_tekebaev\_polychil\_ot\_akaeva\_ychastok\_v\_dybovom\_parke\_za\_yzengy\_kyysh.html/] Accessed 28.12.2016

<sup>15</sup> Ibid.

<sup>16</sup> Ibid.

<sup>17</sup> Podolskaya, Darya (2017) Deputata Zhogorku Kengesha Omurbeka Tekebaeva Arestovali Na Dva Mesyatsa. Published 27.02.2017 [http://24.kg/obschestvo/46059\_deputata\_jogorku\_kenesha\_omurbeka\_tekebaeva\_arestovali\_nadva\_mesyatsa] Accessed 23.03.2017

political regimes.<sup>18</sup> Tekebaev also states that ‘the remaining 51% of shares of ‘Megacom’ were nationalized with the hard work and efforts of the former General Prosecutor Aida Salyanova. Today there are only accusations – it is simply a slander’. Moreover, Tekebaev said that ‘Belize documents turned out to be fake and he had documents to prove it’.<sup>19</sup>

---

<sup>i</sup> Za chto na Aity Salyanovu vzbudili ugovnoe delo i kakoi srok ei grozit? Zanoza.kg Published 27.12. 2016 [http://zanoza.kg/doc/349934\_zhcho\_na\_aidy\_salyanovy\_vozbydili\_ygovnoe\_delo\_i\_kakoy\_srok\_ey\_grozit.html/] Accessed 28.12.2016

---

<sup>18</sup> Marat Kyzy, Aziza (2016). Politicheskie sobyitia, kotorymi zapomnilya 2016. Gezitter.org. Published 30.12. 2016 [http://www.gezitter.org/politic/56479\_politicheskie\_sobyitiya\_kotorymi\_zapomnilya\_2016\_god\_//] Accessed 23.03.2017

<sup>19</sup> Ibid.